

**Imperial College Union
Union Council / 27 June 2023**

Motion to Disestablish Scrutiny Committee

Authors: Jason Zheng – Deputy President (Education)

Seconders: Hayley Wong – Union President
Christian Cooper – Sports Chair, Member of Scrutiny Committee
Anthea MacIntosh-LaRocque – RCSU VP (Welfare and Wellbeing), incoming Council Chair

Union Notes

1. Scrutiny Committee was formed following the Democratic Structures Review carried out by the Union President 2021-22.
2. According to Appendix B of the Standing Orders of Union Council, the Purpose of the Scrutiny Committee is to:
 - a. To communicate the work of the Officer Trustees clearly with the membership of Union Council.
 - b. To carry out an in-depth analysis, coordinating with all other forms of scrutiny utilised by the Union, of the work of Officer Trustees.
 - c. To produce feedback with constructive criticism to guide the work of the Officer Trustees.
 - d. To hold Officer Trustees to account for their work and, when appropriate, recommend Motions of Censure or Motions of No Confidence to Council.
3. Scrutiny Committee has, for a significant part of the year, not been able to fill the entire committee with four members of Council, as required by the Standing Orders.
4. The reports to Scrutiny Committee written by the Officer Trustees are not disseminated beyond Scrutiny Committee and therefore are unavailable to other students to read.
5. The ICSMSU President is a full-time paid elected officer however is not required to submit reports to the Scrutiny Committee.
6. Operationalising Scrutiny Committee requires additional full-time staff time to call for papers, compile and distribute paper packs, arrange meetings, and provide administrative support.
7. The Union is currently planning for an independent, full-scale review of its democratic structures to take place during the 2023-24 academic year. This review can include within its scope a review of how the work of paid officers is scrutinised.

Union Believes

1. That Scrutiny Committee is not an effective method of scrutinising the work of the Officer Trustees.
2. That Scrutiny Committee Reports are not sufficient to communicate the work of the Officer Trustees to Council.
3. That the ICSMSU President, as a paid sabbatical officer, should also be held to a similar level of scrutiny as the Officer Trustees.
4. That Scrutiny Committee decreases the transparency of the work of the Officer Trustees as OT reports are usually seen only by members of Scrutiny Committee and no other Members of the Union.
5. That there are better uses of staff resource than operationalising Scrutiny Committee.
6. That, pending the outcome of the democratic structures review, an acceptable interim solution that will allow Council members to scrutinise the work of paid officers is for all paid officers to submit termly reports to Union Council.

Union Resolves

1. To disestablish the Scrutiny Committee with immediate effect.
2. To amend Appendix A of the Standing Orders of Union Council as shown in Appendix 1 of this paper.
3. To amend Appendix B of the Standing Orders of Union Council as shown in Appendix 2 of this paper.

Note that to fully implement this motion, Bye-Law A – Structure of the Union must also be amended to remove references to Scrutiny Committee. Other amendments to the Union's Bye-Laws have been submitted to Council via a separate paper from the Union President. The requirements of this motion with regards to Bye-Law A have therefore been included in that motion.

Standing Orders of Union Council Appendix A – Standing Requests for Reports

- Council requests that the following Officers submit reports at the end of each Academic Term covering details of their work since the last report to Council~~Scrutiny Committee submits a report to the next Ordinary Meeting after each meeting of the Scrutiny Committee. These reports should cover the performance of the:~~
 - Union President
 - Deputy President (Finance and Services)
 - Deputy President (Clubs and Societies)
 - Deputy President (Welfare)
 - Deputy President (Education)

- ~~• Council requests that the following Officer submit reports to it following each meeting of the Board of Trustees and any sub-committees thereof whose meetings they attend:~~

- ~~○ Council Chair~~

~~These reports are requested to contain summaries of actions and decisions taken by the Board of Trustees in the relevant meetings, especially those actions and decisions which directly relate to Council business.~~

- Council requests that the following Officers:
 - CGCU President
 - RCSU President
 - RSMU President
 - ICSMSU President
 - ~~○ GSU President~~
 - Silwood ChairSPSU President
 - Felix Editor

Submit reports at:

- The first Ordinary Meeting of the Academic Year, after elections for Representatives to Council have taken place
- The first Ordinary Meeting of the second Academic term.
- The last Ordinary Meeting of the Academic Year
- ~~○ The first Ordinary Meeting of the second Academic term.~~

These reports are requested to contain details of activities in the Officer's area of responsibility since the last report to Council; in particular information about their financial position, operational plans/details of recent operations and reports from any relevant junior Officers.

Standing Orders of Union Council Appendix B – Standing Orders of Subcommittees of Council

Clubs, Societies and Projects Board (CSPB):

Purpose:

1. The purpose of the Committee shall be to oversee the Union's Societies and Projects, and the central activities of the Constituent Unions and the 6 Management Groups sitting under this Committee (the CSPB Management Groups).
2. The CSPB Management Groups are:
 - a. Arts and Entertainments
 - b. Knowledge
 - c. Recreation
 - d. Culture
 - e. Community
 - f. Sports

Membership:

3. The Voting Membership of the Committee shall be:
 - a. The Deputy President (Clubs & Societies)
 - b. One representative of each of the Constituent Unions
 - c. One representative of each of the CSPB Management Groups
4. The Non-Voting Membership of the Committee shall be:
 - a. All other Officer Trustees

Structure:

5. The Deputy President (Clubs & Societies) shall chair the Committee.

Powers:

6. The Committee's powers shall be:
 - a. Allocating funding to the Clubs, Societies and Projects and the central activities of the CSPB Management Groups and the Constituent Unions to promote their aims and objectives within the remit of the Societies and Projects Board, up to a value set by the Board of Trustees in the Union's yearly budget.
 - b. Allocating reserve funding up to a value set by the Board of Trustees in the Union's yearly budget.
 - c. Determining Policy governing the management of Clubs, Societies and Projects, and the central activities of the CSPB

Management Groups and Constituent Unions and referring decisions to Council where appropriate.

- d. Delegating powers to the subcommittees of the board where appropriate.

Scrutiny Committee (SC):

Purpose:

- ~~1. The purpose of the Committee shall be:
 - a. To communicate the work of the Officer Trustees clearly with the membership of Union Council.
 - b. To carry out an in-depth analysis, coordinating with all other forms of scrutiny utilised by the Union, of the work of Officer Trustees.
 - c. To produce feedback with constructive criticism to guide the work of the Officer Trustees.
 - d. To hold Officer Trustees to account for their work and, when appropriate, recommend Motions of Censure or Motions of No Confidence to Council.~~

Membership:

- ~~2. The Voting Membership of the Committee shall be:
 - a. The Council Chair
 - b. Four additional members chosen by Council~~
- ~~3. The Non-Voting Membership of the Committee shall be:
 - a. The Officer Trustees~~

Structure:

- ~~4. The Council Chair shall chair the Committee.~~

Powers:

- ~~5. The Committee's powers shall be:
 - a. To mandate the Council Chair submit to Council a Motion of No Confidence or a Motion of Censure in an Officer Trustee.
 - b. To require the Officer Trustees to produce a report to each meeting, including any information requested by the Committee that may be reasonably necessary for the Committee to fulfil its purposes.~~

Community and Welfare Forum (CWF):

Purpose:

1. The purpose of the Forum shall be:
 - a. To act as a forum for discussion of matters relevant to Welfare and Wellbeing Representation; to share best practice in addressing these issues.
 - b. To act as a forum for discussion of matters relevant to community and liberation; to share best practice in addressing these issues
 - c. To regularly review the Accessibility Policy, Halls Policy, Liberation and Community Policy, Religious Observance Policy, and Safe Space Policy, and propose amendment and renewal of these Policies to Council.
 - d. To workshop proposals and motions relating to Community and Welfare before they are brought to Union Council.

Membership:

2. As there will no longer be a requirement for voting, there will no longer be a list of ordinary members. Forum meetings will be open to all members of the Union, and the chair may invite guest observers or speakers at their discretion. Additionally, the following individuals will receive written notice of meeting topics and papers in advance of each meeting:
 - a. The Officer Trustees
 - b. The Constituent Faculty Union Welfare Officers
 - c. The Postgraduate Academic and Welfare Officers
 - d. The Liberation and Community Officers
 - e. The Wellbeing Departmental Representatives
 - f. The Constituent Union Presidents
 - g. Management Group Chairs
 - h. PGT & PGR Representation Chairs
 - i. UG Departmental Wellbeing Representatives
 - j. Leaders of Union-recognised campaigns
3. If an individual or group affiliated with the Union is not on this list but would like to receive the papers and agenda in advance of each meeting, they may request this by contacting the chair.

Structure:

4. The Deputy President (Welfare) shall chair the Forum.
 - a. Highlighted updates and wins – this section of the meeting will share best practice amongst the wellbeing reps and liberation & community officers.
 - b. Discussion of a theme – 5-6 major themes will be chosen based on the manifestos of elected officers and the objectives of ICU's research programme. These will be updated on an annual basis.

- c. Council workshopping – time will be given to provide feedback for papers brought to the meeting as well as to develop papers for ideas discussed during the meeting.

Powers:

5. The Forum shall not have decision-making powers.

Constituent Union Forum (CUF):

Purpose:

1. The purpose of the Forum shall be:
 - a. To act as a forum for discussion of Constituent Union issues, including the support offered by the Union for Constituent Unions, and inter-Constituent Union coordination.
 - b. To regularly review the Mascotry Policy, and propose amendment and renewal of this Policy to Council.
 - c. To ratify Constituent Union Standing Orders

Membership:

2. The Voting Membership of the Forum shall be:
 - a. The Union President
 - b. Two Representatives from each Constituent Union
3. The Non-Voting Membership of the Forum shall be:
 - a. All other Officer Trustees
4. Forum meetings will be open to all full members of the Union as non-voting attendees.

Structure:

5. The Union President shall chair the Forum.

Powers:

6. The Forum's powers shall be:
 - a. Ratification of Constituent Union Standing Orders that have been approved by the Constituent Union's General Committee, pursuant to Bye-Law L.28.

Services and Facilities Forum (SFF):

Purpose:

1. The purpose of the Forum shall be:
 - a. To act as a forum for discussion around the services offered by the Union and facilities across campuses for students and student groups.

Membership:

2. As there will no longer be a requirement for voting, there will no longer be a list of ordinary members. Forum meetings will be open to all full members of the Union, and the chair may invite guest observers or speakers at their discretion. Attendees from the following areas should be strongly encouraged to attend:
 - a. The Officer Trustees
 - b. User Groups' committees
 - c. Casual student workers of the Union
 - d. Management Group committees
 - e. Constituent Union committees

Structure:

3. The Deputy President (Finance & Services) shall chair the Forum.

Powers:

4. The Forum shall not have decision-making powers.

Sustainability and Environment Forum (SEF):

Purpose:

1. The purpose of the Forum shall be:
 - a. To act as a forum for discussion of matters of sustainability – environmental, financial, and social.

Membership:

2. As there will no longer be a requirement for voting, there will no longer be a list of ordinary members. Forum meetings will be open to all full members of the Union, and the chair may invite guest observers or speakers at their discretion. Attendees from the following areas should be strongly encouraged to attend:
 - a. The Officer Trustees
 - b. The Ethics & Environment Network, including the Ethics & Environment Officer
 - c. CSPs, campaigns and student groups, with core aims aligned to sustainability and the environment
 - d. Business School Vice President of Sustainability

Structure:

3. The Deputy President (Finance & Services) shall chair the Forum.

Powers:

4. The Forum shall not have decision-making powers.

Events Forum (EVF):

Purpose

1. The purpose of the Forum shall be:
 - a. To act as a forum for discussion around Union-led and student-led events

Membership

2. As there will no longer be a requirement for voting, there will no longer be a list of ordinary members. Forum meetings will be open to all full members of the Union, and the chair may invite guest observers or speakers at their discretion. Attendees from the following areas should be strongly encouraged to attend:
 - a. The Officer Trustees
 - b. Each of the Management Group committees
 - c. Each of the Constituent Union committees
 - d. Casual student workers at the Union
3. For large events, like Welcome Week and Summer Ball, the Deputy President (Finance & Services) can commission a closed forum of regular membership. Membership must be passed by the Officer Trustees and Council within two weeks of the closed Forum commencing.

Structure

4. The Deputy President (Finance & Services) shall chair the Forum.

Powers

5. The Forum shall not have decision-making powers.

Taught Academic Representation Forum

Purpose:

1. The purpose of the Forum shall be:
 - a. To act as a forum for discussion of matters relevant to the Education of Undergraduate and Postgraduate Taught students.
 - b. To facilitate campaigning to promote the Union's Policies within the remit of Taught Academic Representation.

Membership:

2. The Non-Voting Membership of the Forum shall be:

- a. The Officer Trustees
 - b. The Constituent Faculty Union Academic Officers
 - c. The Postgraduate Taught Academic and Welfare Officers
 - d. The Postgraduate Taught Representation Chair
 - e. The Undergraduate and Postgraduate Taught Departmental Representatives
3. Forum meetings will be open to all Full Members of the Union to attend. Members who are interested in attending should contact the Chair for an invitation.

Structure:

4. The Deputy President (Education) shall chair the Forum.

Powers:

5. The Forum shall not have decision-making powers.

Research Academic Representation Forum (RARF):

Purpose:

1. The purpose of the Forum shall be:
 - a. To act as a forum for discussion of matters relevant to the Education of Postgraduate Research students.
 - b. To facilitate campaigning to promote the Union's Policies within the remit of Research Academic Representation.

Membership:

2. The Non-Voting Membership of the Forum shall be:
 - a. The Officer Trustees
 - b. The Postgraduate Research Academic and Welfare Officers
 - c. The Postgraduate Research Representation Chair
 - d. The Postgraduate Research Departmental Representatives
3. Forum meetings will be open to all Full Members of the Union to attend. Members who are interested in attending should contact the Chair for an invitation.

Structure:

4. The Deputy President (Education) shall chair the Forum.

Powers:

5. The Forum shall not have decision-making powers.