

## MINUTES OF THE PROCEEDINGS

of the eight ordinary meeting of

the

#### Council

of the

Imperial College Union in the 2007-08 Session

The meeting of Union Council was held in the Union Building on 28<sup>th</sup> April 2008 at 6.30pm in the Union Dining Hall.

#### Present:

Council Chair Mark Mearing – Smith President Stephen Brown

Deputy President (Clubs & Societies)

Deputy President (Education & Welfare)

Alistair Cott

Kirsty Patterson (left 8.05pm)

Deputy President (Finance & Services)

ICSMSU President

A&E Chair RCC Chair RSM President

Welfare Campaigns Officer ICSMSU Welfare Officer

CGCU Academic Affairs Officer (Taught)

CGCU ordinary member (Undergraduate) CGCU ordinary member (Undergraduate)

CGCU ordinary member (Undergraduate)

CGCU ordinary member (Postgraduate) RCSU ordinary member (Undergraduate) RCSU ordinary member (Undergraduate)

RCSU ordinary member (Undergraduate)

RCSU ordinary member (Undergraduate) RCSU ordinary member (Postgraduate) ICSMSU ordinary member (Undergraduate) ICSMSU ordinary member (Undergraduate)

**Permanent observers** 

Union Manager Governance and Administration Coordinator Kirsty Patterson (left Chris Larvin

Tim Wills Andy Mason Eugene Chang

Danny Hill (left 7.40pm) Hannah Theodorou

Mo Khaki

Alexander Grisman (left 8.05pm, proxy John James)

John James John O'Neil

Rosie Smithells (left 8.05pm)

Ashley Brown Shray Amar

Ryan Dee (left 7.40) Mark Saleme (left 8.05pm

proxy A&E Chair) Jose Videria Amar Joshi Mark Chamberlain Alexander Walls

Peter Haldane Rebecca Coxhead

**Observers:** Felix Editor Tom Roberts, Felix Editor elect Jovan Nedic, Deputy President (Finance & Services) elect Christian Carter, Afonso Campos, Jon Matthews, Andrew Somerville, Dr. Resham Baruah

**Apologies:** RCSU President Jennifer Morgan – proxy President, GSA Chair Killian Frensch – proxy DFPS, ACC Chair Luke Taylor – proxy DPCS, OSC Chair Marie-Louisa Awolaja, Media Group Chair Karl Bonney (proxy CGCU Postgraduate ordinary member), SCC Chair Lily Topham, WCUS President Leila Serrao, CAG Chair Radha Gadhok – proxy Christoph Aymanns, RAG Chair Karandeep Dhanoa – proxy RCC Chair, Equal Opportunities Officer Chiraush Patel – proxy Welfare Campaigns Officer, RCSU Welfare Officer Inger Eriksson – proxy DPEW, RCSU Academic Affairs Officer (Taught) Andreas Esau, ICSMSU Education Rep (56) Hannah Dixon, ICSMSU Education Rep (4 and PG) Laura Thomas – proxy Mark Chamberlain, ICSMSU Education Rep (123) Sukhpreet Dubb, CGCU Academic Affairs Officer (Research) Eirini Spentza, CGCU ordinary member (Undergraduate) Owen Connick, ICSMSU ordinary member (Undergraduate) Olivia Kenyon

Not present:, CGCU Welfare Officer Sam Piper

#### 1. CHAIR'S BUSINESS

#### NOTED:

- a) The C & G CU President has now resigned.
  - The President asked Council to suspend the Constitutional regulation 4
    elections and referenda, C nominations and timetable, 19. In the event of a
    vacancy, nomination papers shall go up within ten College days of the vacancy
    occurring.
  - ii. The President suggested as there are elections shortly occurring; let them run their course and then reassess what needs to occur.
  - iii. Council moved to a vote to suspend Constitutional regulation 4 elections and referenda, C nominations and timetable, 19. It was unanimously accepted 1 with abstention.

#### **RESOLVED:**

- 1) To suspend Constitutional regulation 4 elections and referenda, C nominations and timetable, 19.
- b) The Council Chair will not be able to take the last Council for the year and thus will find a replacement; potentially the Council Chair elect.

## 2. MINUTES FROM LAST MEETING – 17<sup>th</sup> March 2008

#### NOTED:

a) In regards to agenda item 11, point e) it is the Education act and not Elections Act as stated in the minutes.

#### **RESOLVED:**

1) To accept the amended minutes

#### 3. MATTERS ARISING

#### NOTED:

- a) John James has been added to the Building Redevelopment working group mailing list.
- b) The C & G CU President was informed of his motion of censure.
- c) The A&E Chair did complete the proofing of the HE Policy and was greatly thanked.

## 4. PRESIDENT REPORT

RECEIVED: The report was presented by the President

## NOTED:

- a) The Building Redevelopment working group did not meeting during the Easter break due to there being no design meetings occurring during this time and thus there nothing to discuss.
  - i. The working group will meet once the design meetings have occurred and thus there will be something to consult with the group on.
- b) The projected start date for building works is the end of summer, early autumn.
- c) In regards to sabbatical office space, it is unsure what phase this will be implemented and this will rely on external factors such as funding.
- d) The President was questioned as to what was happening with the recycle bins being bought in to the Union.
  - i. The President stated that he is unsure when College are intending to bring in the bins to the Union.
- e) After having no response from the C & G CU President, the President took the role of Returning Officer for the C & G CU elections
- f) Council moved to a vote to accept the report and it was accepted unanimously.

## **RESOLVED:**

1) To accept the report.



It was proposed to consider agenda item 15 as the next item of business. There were no objections.

## 15. RESTORING UNION STATUS TO THE RSM

RECEIVED: The motion was presented by Jon Matthews and the RSM President

#### NOTED:

- a) Jon Matthews highlighted and raised the following points:
  - i. The intention of the motion is to create Constituent and Campus Unions.
  - ii. Wye and Silwood undertake the function of both welfare and clubs and societies
  - iii. The RSM also undertake these functions and yet are still a division of CGCU.
  - iv. This paper has the has the fourth highest number of seconders supporting this motion which considering the seconders were gathered during the holidays shows Union members strongly support this motion.
  - v. The RSM have academic representatives however they do not have the same rights as academic officers.
- b) The current RSM President explained that previous RSM President have had similar views in the past and referred to two past Presidents who were present at this meeting of Council lending there support to the paper.
  - i. The RSM presented stated that in his opinion the RSM of recent has gone from strength to strength and is moving forward.
- c) The following discussion took place in regards to increasing the membership of Executive Committee to include the Presidents of the Constituent and Campus Unions.
  - i. The President expressed his opposition to the extra Executive Committee membership for the following reasons:
  - ii. Executive Committee is a managerial and operational committee which does not benefit from increased membership.
  - iii. Geographically, Wye and Silwood are constrained to attend Union meetings. Jon Matthews responded that this is not always the case and referred to Nichola Hawkins who was the Welfare representative at Wye who was an avid attendee of Union meetings.
  - iv. It was pointed that quorum would not be affected by the increased membership: this remains at 6.
  - v. Jon Matthews questioned if Executive Committee had ever had a fully populated meeting of which the reply was no.

# At this point in the meeting quorum was called and it was deemed that the meeting met quorum.

- vi. The Deputy President (Education & Welfare) stated that the Governance review looked in to ideal numbers for Executive Committee and the result was 12-15 and so the proposed increase in membership fits in with that.
- vii. The CGCU Postgraduate representative stated that just because RSM, Wye and Silwood have large number of members does not give them automatic rights to places on Union committees. If this was the case then many CSC and indeed clubs and societies could ask for the same rights as they also have large membership numbers. Jon Matthews stated that those groups do not do 'welfare' which is he difference.
- viii. The Deputy President (Finance & Services) stated that Executive Committee members are not there to represent their groups; they are there for the best of all union members.
- d) It was questioned as the absence of Wye and Silwood as seconders of the paper.
  - i. Jon Matthews stated that he had tried to contact them but had no reply from them and suggested that they may have been on holiday.



- ii. The Deputy President (Finance & Services) pointed out that Silwood is a mainly Postgraduate campus that would be unaffected by the Easter break.
- e) Rosie Smithells questioned who attended MPG (Management and Planning Group)
  - The President stated that this weekly meeting is attended by sabbatical officers, including the Medic President, and the General Manager and Deputy General Manager.
  - ii. Rosie Smithells stated that during the Governance review, Hamish Common was against reducing the numbers on Executive Committee and making it another MPG.
  - iii. The President asked Rosie Smithells to justify and back up her statement of which she could not.
  - iv. The CGCU AAO (taught) reminded that Executive Committee has nothing to do with representation; it is managerial and operational.
- f) Council moved to a vote on increasing the membership of Executive Committee to include the Presidents of the Constituent and Campus Unions.
- g) Jon Matthews summed up his argument by stating that organisations manage well by bring disparate voices together by getting more points of view.
  - i. Jon Matthews stated that he has consulted widely.
  - ii. RSM is being treated as second class citizens and they are a passionate group who should have a voice in the central Union.
  - iii. Council moved to a vote to strike out Regulation 5, B, Executive Committee, line 3 'The Presidents of the Constituent and Campus Unions,'

FOR 22 AGAINST 5 ABSTAIN 2 Passed

#### **RESOLVED:**

- 1) To strike line 3 of Regulation 5, B, the Executive Committee and thus not give the Presidents of the Constituent and Campus Unions and seat on the Union Executive Committee.
- h) The President moved to strike line 3 of both C. Clubs and Societies Board and D. Representation and Welfare Board of Regulation 5, where the proposed change was to give the Presidents of the Constituent and Campus Unions and seat on both committees.
- i) Christian Carter pointed out that the RSM would be represented twice; as a Faculty of Engineering and the RSM.
  - i. Jon Matthews pointed out that the GSA are presented twice also through Postgraduate members and through faculty.
- j) Rosie Smithells proposed a procedural motion that the vote to should be roll call vote.
  - i. Council moved to vote on procedural motion; roll call vote. Results as follows:

FOR 6 AGAINST 21 ABSTAIN 3 1. Falls

k) Council moved to vote on accept the change to Regulation 5, C and B, line 3, adding 'The Presidents of the Constituent and Campus Unions,' to the CSB and RWB membership.

FOR 7
AGAINST 15
ABSTAIN 4
Falls

I) The CGCU Postgraduate Representative suggested amending line 2 of both C. Clubs and Societies Board and D. Representation and Welfare Board of



Regulation 5 to give Faculty Unions 2 representatives each and that that CGCU can ensure that one of the Representatives is from RSM.

- i. The Deputy President (Education & Welfare) expressed her disagreement in changing a Faculty Unions Constitution.
- ii. It was reminded that Council can mandate a change in a Faculty Unions Constitution.
- iii. Council moved to a vote to change Regulation 5, C and D, line to read '2 representatives appointed by each of the Faculty Unions'

FOR unanimous

AGAINST 1 ABSTAIN 6

Passed.

## **RESOLVED:**

- 2) Regulation 5, C. The Clubs and Societies Board and D. the Representation and Welfare Board, line 2 to read as follows:
  - 2. '2 representatives appointed by each of the Faculty Unions'
- m) The Deputy President (Finance & Services) questioned why the paper was also changing the Standing Orders of the GSA and what relevance that had to the motion presented.
  - i. Jon Matthews stated that the reason he changed it was to make it fairer as this rule is inconsistent to what is required of others.
  - ii. The Deputy President (Finance & Services) stated this had nothing to do with the motion presented and is not relevant and that if Jon Matthews felt that this injustice was so great, another paper should be bought to Council and this change just not 'slipped in'.
- n) Jon Matthews agreed to strike point 77.
- o) The Deputy President (Finance & Services) moved to vote to reject the paper for the following reasons.
  - i. He has been involved in the RSM from day 1 of his degree and in his opinion does not reflect the sentiment of all RSM members.
  - ii. RSM members were not consulted with.
  - iii. Claude's Café and Southside petitions raised more seconders that this motion.
  - iv. This motion does not reflect the nature of the RSM; RSM is about spirit.
  - v. In regards to point 18, this is subjective and gave the example of Sid Singh and Leah Glass being synergetic in their relationship.
  - vi. Rosie Smitthells questioned if the Deputy President (Finance & Services) felt that more seconders would make the motion more valid.
  - vii. The Deputy President (Finance & Services) referred to point 4; 'the majority of RSM...' 184 is no a majority in his opinion.
  - viii. Jon Mathews stated that 184 seconders is actually the fault of the central Union.
- p) Jon Mathews acknowledged that he is not a member of the RSM but was asked to lead this motion by the RSM.
- q) The Deputy President (Finance & Services) questioned the validity of the seconders.
  - i. Jon Matthews demanded that the Deputy President (Finance & Services) retract his allegation of inferring that he was a liar.
  - ii. The Deputy President (Finance & Services) asked the Council Chair to read two 2 email that were sent from the RSM Chair to the RSM lobbying for seconders. They are as follows:

From: Hill, Daniel Sent: 12 April 2008 19:36 To: ESE UG GEOSC3

Subject: Just reply - Union Status?

hey all,



can u make sure you have all replied to this email......all u have to do is click 2 buttons

trust me its very worth doing!

cheers.

From: RSM President - Daniel Hill Sent: Wed 09/04/2008 10:34 AM

To: ESE UG GEOSC2; ESE UG GEOSC3; ESE UG GEOSC4 Subject: Read this email, agree with it and reply - Union Status?

Dear All,

I'm currently in the process of attempting to get Union status back for the RSM. This has turned into a lengthy process this year.

Jon Matthews and I have written papers for a Union Council meeting that is happening at the end of the month. We need seconders for the propasal paper....ideally around 200!

#### If you would like to second this motion then please reply to this email ASAP.

Attached is a first draft of the proposal paper we will be presenting. If you require further info then please contact me.

Kind Regards,

Daniel.

From: RSM President - Daniel Hill

Sent: 15 April 2008 19:23

To: ESE UG GEOSC1; ESE UG GEOSC2; ESE UG GEOSC3; Materials, UG-1st Year; Materials, UG-2nd

Year; Materials, UG-3rd Year

Subject: Click Reply, then click send! Cheers

RSM,

I still need more seconders! 100 down, 100 to go!

Its a win win situation for us - better representation and more money for RSM Clubs and activities!

All you have to do is reply to this email.

I'm currently in the process of attempting to get Union status back for the RSM.

Jon Matthews and I have written papers for a Union Council meeting that is happening at the end of the month. We need seconders for the propasal paper....ideally around 200!

## If you would like to second this motion then please reply to this email ASAP.

Attached is a first draft of the proposal paper we will be presenting. If you require further info then please contact me.

Kind Regards,

Daniel.

From: RSM President - Daniel Hill

Sent: 09 April 2008 10:35

**To:** ESE UG GEOSC2; ESE UG GEOSC3; ESE UG GEOSC4 **Subject:** Read this email, agree with it and reply - Union Status?

Dear All,



I'm currently in the process of attempting to get Union status back for the RSM. This has turned into a lengthy process this year.

Jon Matthews and I have written papers for a Union Council meeting that is happening at the end of the month. We need seconders for the propasal paper....ideally around 200!

#### If you would like to second this motion then please reply to this email ASAP.

Attached is a first draft of the proposal paper we will be presenting. If you require further info then please contact me.

Kind Regards,

Daniel.

- iii. Rosie Smithells stated that the emails are factual in that more money will be received for the RSM.
- iv. Jon Matthews called a point of privilege and the Chair to state that the emails are not evidence and the Chair to rule on the slur on the integrity of himself, Rosie and Kirsty.
- v. The Deputy President (Finance & Services) stated that the way in which the signatures were collected is what he is questioning.
- vi. The Deputy President (Finance & Services) stated that he will retract the allegation if it be minuted that he has severe concern in the manner that the seconders were collected.
- r) John James questioned as to what the opinion of the President was to throw out the motion.
  - i. The President stated that it is Councils decision on what to do with the motion.
- s) It was questioned if CID's were collected when collecting seconders.
  - i. Rosie Smithells stated that they have emails replied to as proof and it is not required that CIDs are presented with list of seconders.
  - ii. It was pointed that people don't necessarily read the emails that they have responded to and that by promising money they may have just click reply without fully understating what they were agreeing to.
  - iii. The CGCU Postgraduate representative stated that he is broadly in support of the paper but had concerns over the second email being misleading.
- t) A roll call vote was called and Council moved to vote on the vote being a roll call.

FOR 12 AGAINST 5 ABSTAIN 0 Passed

## **RESOLVED:**

- 3) To vote on the motion with a roll call vote.
- u) Council moved to vote on to pass the amended motion and the results are as follows

FOR				
President				
Deputy President (Clubs & Societies)				
Deputy President (Education & Welfare)				
John James				
Alex Grisman				
Ashley Brown				
John O'Neil				
Rosie Smithells				
Mark Salame				
Amar Joshi				
Andy Mason				
Jennifer Morgan – proxy				
Luke Taylor – proxy				
13				

AGAINST	
Deputy President (Finance & Services)	
Alex Walls	
Mark Chamberlain	
Mo Khaki	
ICSMSU Education representatives – proxy (2)	
Eugene Chang	
Karendeep Dhakoa	
	8

ABSTAIN	
Killian Frensch	
Inger Erikson	
Karl Bonney	
Hannah Theodorou	
Chiraush Patel	
Shray Amar	
Jose Videra	
	7

Motion falls

At this point (8.05pm) Rosie Smithells stood down as CGCU Ordinary Member

The agenda resumed normal ordering at this point.

## 5. DEPUTY PRESIDENT (CLUBS & SOCIETIES) REPORT

RECEIVED: The report was presented by the Deputy President (Clubs & Societies)

#### NOTED:

- a) There are now approximately 302 Clubs and Societies operating within the Union
- b) The level of funding for Clubs and Societies for 08-09 will be known by the end of the term which is when the subvention bid is known.
- c) The RCC Chair thanked the Deputy President (Clubs & Societies) for all his extra work that he has put in with clubs, specifically driving when they could not get drivers.
- d) Council moved to a vote to accept the report and it was accepted unanimously.

#### **RESOLVED:**

1) To accept the report.

## 6. DEPUTY PRESIDENT (EDUCATION & WELFARE) REPORT

RECEIVED: The report was presented by the President on behalf of the Deputy President (Education & Welfare)

#### NOTED:

- a) It was questioned as to why the Deputy President (Education & Welfare) did not stay to present her report when she is a paid Officer of the Union and thus should be expected to be present at Council.
  - i. The President stated that it is acceptable for another Officer to present a report on behalf of the author and in light of the stressful debate on the last motion, it is understandable that the Deputy President (Education & Welfare) needed some 'time out'.
  - ii. The Deputy President (Finance & Services) suggested that Council should be considerate to the Deputy President (Education & Welfare) due to the intensity of debate that had just occurred.
- b) In regards to the SAF space request, the ICSMSU President stated that he and many academics are opposed to this and feels that they had been poorly consulted throughout.



- i. Dr. Resham Baruah stated that she is strongly opposed to this removal of space and will get involved to fight against this.
- c) Council moved to a vote to accept the report and it was accepted unanimously.

#### **RESOLVED:**

1) To accept the report.

## 7. DEPUTY PRESIDENT (FINANCE & SERVICES) REPORT

RECEIVED: The report was presented by the Deputy President (Finance & Services)

#### NOTED:

- a) The acts for the Summer Ball have all be confirmed and can be found on the Union website.
- b) The new minibuses have been signed off by Executive Committee and will be received in September.
- c) It was questioned what the likely changes will be to the Web Policy,
  - i. Possibly will add some type of summary punishment for abuse of rules.
- d) It was questioned as to whether the College Information Systems Security Group had decided on rules on Facebook abuse.
  - It was clarified that it was a discussion specific to fitness to practice about Medical Students
- e) It was reiterated that there had been a poor response in regards to students joining the Summer Ball working group.
- f) Council moved to a vote to accept the report and it was accepted unanimously.

#### **RESOLVED:**

1) To accept the report.

## 8. FELIX REPORT

RECEIVED: The report was presented by the Felix Editor

## NOTED:

- a) The President expressed that again Felix has been awesome this term and congratulated the Editor and his team.
- b) Council moved to a vote to accept the report and it was accepted unanimously.

## **RESOLVED:**

1) To accept the report.

#### 9. GSA REPORT

RECEIVED: The report was presented by the President on behalf of the GSA Chair

#### NOTED:

- a) The President congratulated the GSA on a extremely successful Spring mingle.
- b) Council moved to a vote to accept the report and it was accepted unanimously.

#### **RESOLVED:**

1) To accept the report.

#### 10. ICSMSU REPORT

RECEIVED: The report was presented by the ICSMSU President

#### NOTED:

a) The ICSMSU President expressed concern of the back log of transfers which have not been proceed.

b) Council moved to a vote to accept the report and it was accepted unanimously.

#### **RESOLVED:**

1) To accept the report.

#### 11. RCSU REPORT

RECEIVED: No one was present to table the report.

#### NOTED:

- a) The Deputy President (Finance & Services) expressed how well the Science Challenge went.
- b) Council moved to a vote to accept the report and it was accepted unanimously.

## **RESOLVED:**

1) To accept the report.

#### 12. RSM REPORT

RECEIVED: No one was present to table the report.

#### NOTED:

a) Council moved to a vote to accept the report and it was accepted unanimously.

#### **RESOLVED:**

1) To accept the report.

#### 13. NUS CONFERENCE REPORT

RECEIVED: The report was presented by the President

## NOTED:

- a) The President expressed his congratulations to the delegates for surviving their time in Blackpool.
- b) The President reported that one delegate did not keep to mandate when voting.
  - i. It was suggested that deposits are taken from delegates that will then be kept if they vote against mandate similar to what is done in Union Sabbatical elections when candidates break election regulations.
- c) Alex Grisman was thanked for stepping in as a last minute replacement.
- d) Signatures to hold a referendum to disaffiliate from the NUS are currently being gathered.
- e) Many of the larger Universities are upset about the Governance changes not being passed and tried to get an emergency meeting.
- f) Council moved to a vote to accept the report and it was accepted unanimously.

#### **RESOLVED:**

1) To accept the report.

## 14. COUNCIL WORKING GROUP

RECEIVED: The report was presented by the President on behalf of the Deputy President (Education & Welfare)

#### NOTED:

a) If any Council member wished to join this working group, please contact the Deputy President (Education & Welfare).

## 15. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

## 15.1 Court Appointment

RECEIVED: The paper was presented by the President

## NOTED:

- a) Alex Guite was here to speak to his nomination however had to leave.
- b) Alex is a terribly experienced member of the Union and would offer valuable contribution to the Court.
- c) Council moved to a vote to accept the paper and it was unanimously accepted.

## **RESOLVED:**

Meeting closed 8.40pm

1) To accept the recommendation of the Executive Committee and appoint Alex Guite to the Union Court.

Approved as a correct rec meeting of Union Council			
on	2007/08		
		Chair of the Meeting	