IMPERIAL COLLEGE UNION COURT STANDING ORDERS

Any Part or section with an asterisk requires the approval of the Trustee Board. 1

Footnotes are included as part of the standing orders where necessary to explain the provenance of any rule or make comments upon it.

Introduction

The Union Court standing orders are the internal rules of the Court. The Court is permitted to run its own procedure², and to pass standing orders³ for its own administration. These are done by the Court itself (by a two-thirds majority⁴), however some standing orders which concern access to the Court, appeals or other miscellaneous matters also require the approval of the Trustee Board.⁵

Though they are internal rules only as the Court is prohibited from making policy for the rest of the Union⁶, they do affect others when they have any dealings with the Court.

The standing orders should be read in conjunction with the Court regulation and make more sense when so read. Each part refers any relevant part of the Court regulation.

Standing orders are entitled to disapply the certain regulations⁸ for the Court's own internal procedure,⁹ though this does not affect any other part of the Union, and certainly not the Council in its appointment or election of members. However, were the Court to act internally to censure or no confidence a member, it would have to comply with the full procedure for doing so.

The Code of Conduct, which applies to the members of the Court rather than the Court itself, ¹⁰ has further rules for members' demeanour and management of a hearing.

A. Administration

Chair and Deputy Chair

- 1. The Chair and Deputy Chair shall be appointed by the Court in committee. 11
- 2. All members of the Court except a staff member of Imperial College ¹² or temporary members ¹³ are eligible to become Chair or Deputy Chair. However, if the Chair is a Life Member of the Union, the Deputy Chair must be a Full Member of the Union, and vice-versa. ¹⁴
- If either the Chair or Deputy Chair is out of contact for at least twenty-four hours, disqualified from acting or vacant then the other shall exercise any joint authority

¹ Regulation 2.19

² Constitution 9.1.4

³ Regulation 2.18

Regulation 2.18

Regulation 2.19

⁵ Regulation 2.19

⁶ Constitution 9.3 and regulation 2.2

⁷ Regulation 2

⁸ Regulations 3, 4, 5, 6 and 7

⁹ Regulation 2.18.2

¹⁰ Constitution 9.6 and regulation 2.17

¹¹ Regulation 2.14

¹² Constitution 3.5.5 (relating to College staff chairing a committee)

¹³ Regulation 2.12 (permitting restriction of rights of temporary members)

¹⁴ Regulation 2.14

- (that is any act which requires both the Chair and Deputy Chair to act jointly upon in these standing orders or elsewhere) by himself or herself.
- 4. If there is a vacancy in the post of Chair, the Deputy Chair shall be the Acting Chair. If both Chair and Deputy Chair are vacant, the oldest member of the Court (except the staff member of Imperial College and temporary members) shall be or appoint the Acting Chair.
- 5. Any vacancy should be filled as soon as is practicably possible.
- 6. If there are vacancies in both the Chair and Deputy Chair, the Court may choose which to fill first, and must do so if both posts are subject to competitive election, where it would otherwise be possible that two Full Members or two Life Members could be elected to the Chair and Deputy Chair.¹⁵
- 7. If there is no opposition and a single candidate, that candidate may be appointed to a vacant post. ¹⁶ No advance notice is required to fill a vacancy. If more than one candidate stands (and candidates may stand in their absence), the Court may run a summary election without notice at the meeting to fill the vacant post. ¹⁷
- 8. A motion to remove the Chair or Deputy Chair may be made by any member of the Court with one week's notice, setting out grounds in support. Such a motion may be passed by a simple majority and vacates the post concerned. ¹⁸ This has no effect upon the removed person's status as a member of the Court, nor is it a censure or dismissal under regulation .

Deleted: 5

Temporary members

- 9. Temporary members ¹⁹ have all the rights and duties of full members, except where contrary provision is made.
- The Court, when appointing temporary members when the Council has not appointed members under Regulation 2.12, shall in the case of any dispute over the appointment of an individual elect them in an equivalent manner to standing order A7.
- 11. If the Council appoints one member of the Court within a particular category, such that of two or more temporary members one must have their appointment rescinded, and both wish to remain temporary members, the Court shall choose by lot whose appointment shall be rescinded.²⁰

Meetings in committee

- 12. There shall be a meeting in committee of the Court, not by electronic mail, at least once per term.
- The Chair, Deputy Chair or four members may summon a meeting in committee, which shall meet within ten days of being so called.

¹⁵ If the Chair and Deputy Chair are simultaneously competitively elected it may result in two Life members or two Full members as Chair and Deputy Chair, which would be unconstitutional

¹⁶ Regulation 4.4

¹⁷ Regulation 2.18.2 (permitting the derogation from the Election Regulations)

¹⁸ Regulation 2.18.2 (permitting limited derogation from the Disciplinary Procedure Regulation)

¹⁹ Regulation 2.12 – temporary members can be created if the Council has not elected or appointed three or more members by the 1st November in an academic year

²⁰ Regulation 2.12 rescinds the appointment of a temporary member when Council appoints a new 'full' member of the Court, however it does not state which member would have their appointment rescinded if two or more people were temporarily appointed from within one category in regulation 2.6.2 or 2.6.3 and the Council then appointed some but not all of the remaining posts

Motions of censure and dismissal

- 14. A motion to censure or dismiss a member or temporary member of the Court shall follow the procedure set out in regulation 7, Part F (with "Court" substituting for "Council"), Part I and the procedure for Union meetings in Part B of regulation 6.²¹ There is no appeal.
- 15. A motion must be proposed by a member of the Court and have ten seconders. The seconders may be members of the Court or Full Members of the Union.²² The motion must set out in what respect its subject's actions constituted misconduct²³ in relation to the Code of Conduct.
- 16. The Court must sit in committee, chaired by the Council Chair or nominee who is not a member of the Court. The chair shall have all the rights and duties of a chair of a meeting under regulation 6.

Resolutions by electronic mail

- 17. A resolution of the Court in committee or in session²⁴ may be debated and approved by e-mail under certain circumstances as set out in this Part. A resolution of the Court by e-mail correspondence has the same force as any other resolution.
- 18. No resolution by e-mail may relate to:
 - i. a hearing, 25 (except administrative directions 26)
 - ii. the appointment or removal of the Chair or Deputy Chair, or
 - iii. the internal censure or dismissal of a member of the Court. 27
- 19. A resolution must have the unambiguous approval of an absolute majority (or two-thirds majority if required) of every member of the Court entitled to vote in order to be passed. A positive and declared abstention, as opposed to mere silence, counts as a normal abstention for the purposes of calculating the majority required to approve a measure.
- Any e-mail regarding a discussion or vote must be sent to all other participating members of the Court.
- 21. Minutes must be kept and deposited with the Secretary, comprising copies of each e-mail in such a meeting, or summaries thereof. Those minutes should be presented to the next proper meeting for approval.

²⁶ Regulation 2.30

²¹ Regulation 2.18 excludes internal censure and dismissal motions from derogation from the procedural protections set out in the Disciplinary Procedure regulation – therefore the standing orders must comply with it

²² This does effectively introduce another external element (the other being the involvement of the Council Chair) to an internal process for Court, however the Court must comply with regulation 7.47.1 which requires 10 seconders, which could be more than its total membership

²³ Constitution 17.1.1 and regulation 7.8 – members of the Court may only be censured or dismissed for 'misconduct' whereas other post-holders may also be disciplined for negligence or failure to maintain the confidence of the Council

²⁴ Since hearings must normally be in public (and thus clearly not by e-mail) the only matters "in session" which could be dealt with by e-mail would be directions for administrative issues prior to a hearing

²⁵ Regulation 2.35

²⁷ Regulation 2.18.4

B. Commencement of a case *

This Part supplements Part D of the Court regulation. 1.

Requesting a case

- 2. A case may only be requested in the following circumstances:
 - An interpretation, review or declaration may be requested by any member of the Union or constituent part of the Union,²⁸
 - A request for an adjudication in a role equivalent to that of the Press Complaints Commission may be made by any person or organisation mentioned or referred to in a Union publication, or by the Mediation Board.
 - iii. An appeal in an election or referendum dispute may be made by any candidate or elector in it,
 - iv. An inquiry may be requested by the Council, Executive Committee, 50 Full Members of the Union or any constituent part of the Union,
 - v. A review of any proposed constitutional amendment, regulation, policy or act may be requested by any member of the Union or constituent part of the Union, and
 - vi. A case in another jurisdiction created by any policy or rule shall be summoned in whatever way that policy or rule determines, or by standing orders.

Procedure for accepting a case

- 3. The Chair and Deputy Chair shall initially decide if a case is properly brought. They may ask for additional information from the person or body requesting it or others if required. If they decide to reject it, or disagree, the matter will be referred to the whole Court which shall determine in committee whether to accept it. The Court may delegate certain categories of request to the Chair and Deputy Chair to reject without further reference.
- 4. The fact that a requested case merely appears unmeritorious on its face is not a reason in itself to be disregarded.²⁹ The proper forum for considering the merits of a case is in session.
- 5. The Court cannot institute a case of its own motion, though it may re-institute one if there are reasonable grounds to believe a previous order is not being complied with.
- 6. A case must be accepted notwithstanding the rest of this Part if:
 - i. It is referred by the Trustee Board or the Council,
 - ii. It is an appeal under the Disciplinary Policy³¹ or

²⁸ However, under paragraph 56 of the Disciplinary Policy, requests for reviews of proceedings under the Disciplinary Policy will only be accepted when made by the President or a nominee

²⁹ The process of choosing whether to accept a case exists only to prevent those where there is no student interest at all in its acceptance - the task of deciding its merits lies with the panel, not the Court in its administrative guise

Regulations 2.25

³¹ This does not include disciplinary appeals under other policies, where the appellant will have to demonstrate that the appeal has some merit

iii. It has been referred compulsorily to the Court for review under the constitution or regulations. 32

Pre-commencement directions and interim orders

- A nominee of the Court Chair may make directions, including specified compulsory directions, and interim orders in relation to a request for a case before the Court has decided to accept it or appoint a panel.³³
- 8. Any such direction <u>or interim order</u> shall then be administered by the panel, if appointed. If the Court decides not to hear the case the directions <u>and interim orders</u> shall lapse.

Interpretations, reviews or declarations

- 9. A request for an interpretation, review or declaration must be
 - i. Relevant to the person making the request, or
 - ii. Important to the Union, or any part of it, and in either case
 - iii. Not be a purely hypothetical or academic issue.

Inquiries

- 10. An inquiry³⁴ may be requested if particular events have caused, or are capable of causing, concern among the Full Membership, or there is concern among the Full Membership that particular events may have occurred. An inquiry differs from an interpretation, review or declaration in that it may require the Court to provide an opinion upon the merits and quality of an officer's or committee's decision-making, rather than just its procedural propriety.
- Inquiries requested by a constituent part of the Union may only cover that part of the Union. A more senior constituent part, or several parts, may request the inquiry be widened to cover them.
- 12. In deciding if to agree to conduct an inquiry, the Court may consider whether the subject of the inquiry justifies the time and resources to be spent on it.

Requests for a case by members of the Court

- The Court shall not accept a request for any kind of case by one of its own members unless:³⁵
 - The member is a candidate in an election and appealing the returning officer or election committee's decision,
 - ii. The member was subject to disciplinary proceedings, or
 - The member is personally directly affected by a matter and no other member of the Union not in the Court (who could instead make the request) is similarly affected.
- 14. Any member of the Court or the Court as a whole may complain about a publication matter to the Executive Committee.³⁶ which shall deal with it under its

³² Examples of this include constitution 11.5 & 21.4 (constitutionality of referendum petitions) and regulation 1.28 (arbitration upon request by Trustee Board)

³³ Regulation 2.24

³⁴ Regulation 2.1.5 – inquiries

³⁵ Regulation 2.21 – also note the Code of Conduct prohibits the use of one's position on the Court to advance the interests of others or to assist one's own position in private disputes within the Union ³⁶ Regulation 2.5

own procedures which are not subject to these standing orders. The Mediation Board shall have no role in such cases.

Illogical, vexatious, frivolous or anonymous requests

 A request of any kind within any part of the Court's jurisdiction (except those covered under standing order B6) which is illogical, vexatious, frivolous or anonymous may be disregarded.

Appeals

16. A request to the Court in its appellate jurisdiction (except under the Disciplinary Policy) which appears to be wholly unmeritorious may be disregarded.

Requests outside the Court's jurisdiction

 A request of any kind to the Court to hear a case (except those covered under standing order B6) which appears to have no reasonable prospect of being determinable within the Court's jurisdiction may be disregarded.

C. Appointment of panels

- 1. This part supplements Part E of the Court regulation.
- 2. Once the Court, in committee, has decided or been required to hear a case, a panel to hear it must be appointed as soon as possible.³⁷

Who appoints the panel

- 3. The panel and its chair shall be appointed jointly by the Chair and Deputy Chair, who shall notify the rest of the Court of the panel's appointment.
- 4. In the following cases the Court in committee shall appoint the panel:
 - i. If the Chair and Deputy Chair disagree over any aspect of the panel,
 - ii. The Chair or Deputy Chair refers it, or
 - iii. It is intended that a single person will be the panel.
- No person may participate in the appointment of a panel if they have requested the case under standing order B11.
- A panel should if possible be appointed to include a wide range of members of the Court.

Constitution of the panel

- The panel shall consist of an uneven number of members including a chair. The
 minimum size of a panel is normally three members. No member of the Imperial
 College staff may chair³⁸ or sit alone.
- 8. The Court in committee³⁹ may by two-thirds majority approve individual members of the Court to be entitled to sit alone for any kind of case.
- Any member of the Court may sit alone for a case to determine a matter for which a hearing is not required under standing order <u>D15</u>. In such circumstances

Deleted: D14

³⁸ Constitution 3.5.5 (relating to College staff chairing a committee)

³⁷ Regulation 2.26

³⁹ The potential delegation of authority to a single individual to sit alone is sufficiently significant that such people must be approved by most of their colleagues as being suitable to do so

a single member panel may not make any determination outside the ambit of standing order <u>D15</u> or exercise other jurisdictions under regulation 2.23.⁴⁰ If such rulings appear to be necessary or desirable the single member panel must instead refer the case back to the Court in committee for the minimum panel to be appointed (which may or may not include the original panellist as a member).

Deleted: D14

- A panel, unless it is one person sitting alone, must contain at least one Full Member of the Union.
- No person may sit on a panel if he or she has a conflict of interest under the Code of Conduct.

Panel chair's action

12. The panel chair may take action on behalf of the panel when expressly authorised by the panel to do so.

Alteration or revocation of panel appointment

- The appointment of a panel, once made, cannot be rescinded by any person or body outside the panel.⁴²
- 14. Panel members (except for compliance hearings⁴³) may not be replaced, added to or removed mid-way through a case, except with the approval of the panel⁴⁴ and the case must then be newly commenced and a fresh panel appointed, though it may involve the same members and the previous request for the case⁴⁵ does not need to be renewed. Interim orders and directions shall continue in force pending the appointment of the replacement panel.

Lateness

- 15. If members of a panel are not present at the start of a scheduled hearing:
 - The remaining panel may proceed without them, even if they now comprise an even number of members (including two members),
 - No member may sit alone unless on the agreed panel of those who can.
 - iii. If the panel chair is missing they must choose a chair from amongst them,
 - iv. The absent panel member is removed from the panel, unless the other panel members (having consulted all present interested parties⁴⁶) each assent to the person's later inclusion.

D. Hearings

 This part supplements Part G of the Court regulation and paragraphs 11 – 15 of the code of conduct.

⁴² Regulation 2.28

⁴⁰ Regulation 2.23 allows the Court to deal in other areas of its jurisdiction to ensure it is not prevented from doing its job because of technicalities in the way it was petitioned – however in this case if a single member panellist (other than someone on the list of those who can deal with cases alone) is exceptionally dealing with a simple matter, he or she should not be able to suddenly extend the ambit of the hearing to wider matters

⁴¹ Regulation 2.27

⁴³ Regulation 2.25 and standing orders part F

⁴⁴ Regulation 2.28

⁴⁵ Regulation 2.21 and standing orders part B

⁴⁶ Standing order D6

- 2. The panel chair is responsible for maintaining order and the agenda in the hearing. Any ruling made by him or her may be over-turned by a majority of the panel.
- There shall be no formality of procedure or language beyond that needed fairly to conduct the hearing under the applicable rules.
- 4. Any Full Member of the Union may normally make submissions, arguments or comments to the Court. Any other person may normally do so if they are affected by any potential determination, are a student complaining he or she is discriminated against as a result of opting out of membership of the Union, or with the Court's leave.
- No member of the Court who is not on the panel may make any submission, argument or comment to the Court in a hearing, unless he or she is an interested party in the hearing. A member may give evidence of any matter which he or she witnessed.

Interested parties

- 6. A person or part of the Union who is certain or likely to be personally and directly affected by a potential determination is an "interested party". The Court may deem such individuals as interested parties, though the following are automatically:
 - The person or constituent part of the Union who requested the case to be heard,
 - ii. A constituent part of the Union whose rules are being interpreted,
 - iii. The editor of and, if appropriate, the author or creator of the relevant media item in a publication complaint, and
 - iv. All candidates and the returning officer in an election appeal,
 - v. A person potentially subject to an electoral disqualification, 47
 - vi. A defendant in a disciplinary case or motion. 48
- Reasonable steps must be taken to inform any interested party of the hearing and its purpose, and if practicable to schedule it so that the interested parties can attend.
- 8. An interested party has, along with any rights of a Full Member of the Union:⁴⁹
 - The right of reply in any issue affecting them in the hearing,
 - The right to know what arguments are being advanced in opposition to them, and
 - iii. To attend hearings in closed session unless specifically excluded.
- The absence of an interested party does not invalidate the proceedings, except if standing order <u>K14</u>.iii applies.

Deleted: K13

⁴⁷ Regulation 4.101 – 4.107

⁴⁸ This includes anyone facing proceedings under the Disciplinary Policy, a disciplinary tribunal, a censure or no confidence motion or appealing against them (if within the Court's jurisdiction to hear such an appeal) – those proceedings being reviewed or appealed in the hearing

⁴⁹ This ensures that those affected by a Court decision have the chance properly to answer anything said against them; this also has the effect of giving those who are not Full Members the standard rights of Full Members in relation to the hearing (for example to be present and be heard); see also standing order E8

Deciding disputed facts

- 10. Any evidence may be permitted which is relevant and fair.
- 11. Any person who wishes to give evidence may do so, but must then answer any further questions or suggestions made by the Court or another with its leave. If a person is not prepared to do so their evidence may be disregarded.⁵⁰
- 12. If several people are giving evidence, then they may be excluded from the hearing (even if they are interested parties) until they have done so.⁵¹
- A statement of agreed facts may be produced by direction with the consent of the interested parties.

Disapplied rules

- 14. The following rules within regulation 6 (standing orders for all Union meetings) do ____ Deleted: 4 not apply to the Court in a hearing: 52
 - i. Proxy votes,53
 - ii. Secret and roll-call ballots,54
 - Quorum⁵⁵ (quorum is the whole panel, unless standing order C14 applies),
 - iv. Automatic resignation of members, 56
 - v. Closed session⁵⁷ (instead regulations 2.4, 2.35 and 2.40 apply⁵⁸)

When hearings may be dispensed with

- A determination or report may be made without any public hearing (though a hearing can nevertheless be convened) only in the following circumstances:⁵⁹
 - A request for a report in relation to a proposed constitutional amendment, regulation, policy or act,
 - ii. Approving (but not rejecting) a referendum petition as constitutional, ⁶⁰
 - Approving (but not rejecting) a new referendum returning officer or members of a referendum committee, ⁶¹ and
 - iv. Referring a breach of a penalty back to the Disciplinary Committee under section 44 of the Disciplinary Policy, if the person or body accused of breaching it accepts the breach.

_

⁵⁰ "Cross-examination" provision – this means that no person can simply speak about disputed facts without having what they say tested if necessary. This relates only to "evidence", that is, what events may or may not have happened. This is distinguished from submissions or suggestions about what the rules or policies mean.

⁵¹ This is an old rule of evidence to make it more difficult for people to fabricate an account as they can't hear what the others are saying or what questions are being asked of them before they testify

⁵² Regulation 2.18.2

⁵³ Regulations 6.23 – 6.25 and 2.16

⁵⁴ Regulation 6.22

⁵⁵ Regulations 6.29 – 6.30

⁵⁶ Regulations 6.31 – 6.32

⁵⁷ Regulations 6.39 – 6.42

⁵⁸ Parts of regulation 2 which determine when closed session may be or is required to be used

⁵⁹ Regulation 2.34

 $^{^{60}}$ Constitution 11.5 and regulations 4.34 - 4.35

⁶¹ Regulation 4.38

 Directions can be made without a public hearing but are then subject to a later review in a hearing.⁶²

 A determination or report may be made without any public hearing in any case if the panel and all interested parties agree.

Form
Number

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

Closed session

18. The Court may, but need not, direct that a hearing or part of a hearing is in closed session only if:

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

- Staff matters are being discussed (compulsorily in closed session),
- ii. A member of the Union staff is giving evidence in his capacity as a member of staff, unless he or she consents to being heard in public,
- A decision or act under the Disciplinary Policy, Disciplinary and Complaints Regulation, or other disciplinary procedure is being reviewed, and a defendant student or body does not wish it to be in public,
- iv. The Court is of the view that the quality of a person's evidence would be improved by it being given in private, due to its sensitivity or their vulnerability,
- It relates to a without notice application for a direction to search premises or other purpose, or
- vi. In cases of grave disorder.

E. Determinations and reports

1. This part supplements Part H of the Court regulation.

General principles

- A determination or interim determination consists of an opinion from each member of the panel and one set of orders (or none) from the panel as a whole.
 At least one opinion should contain a summary of the decided facts.
- Each member of the panel must write an opinion, or agree with another's. Each
 opinion must be reasoned, and reasons given for making any order, or none. If
 dissenting, reasons for the dissent must be given or the alternative line of
 reasoning explained, or another's dissent agreed with.
- 4. The imposition of any order is subject to the approval of the majority of the panel. The panel chair must vote like other members of the committee. If the panel is equally divided, the panel chair will cast a second and deciding vote.
- In disciplinary proceedings, acting as the Disciplinary Committee, Appeals Committee or a disciplinary tribunal⁶³, a finding of misconduct shall only be made if no more than one member of the panel dissents.

Abstentions prohibited

 No member of the panel may abstain from an order or opinion when making a determination, including the chair. An abstention is deemed to be notice of resignation from the Court.⁶⁴

⁶³ Under the Disciplinary Policy or Discipline and Complaints Regulation respectively

⁶² Regulation 2.30

⁶⁴ This measure may seem harsh but unlike normal Union committees where one is entitled to vote or not according to one's wishes, the Court (and therefore its members) are required to come to a view and resolve matters; if one is incapable of doing so there is no purpose in one being on the Court

- 7. An abstention is to be regarded as the refusal to write an opinion or agreement under standing order E3 or vote either way upon an order. Absence from or tardiness in a hearing (see standing order C14) or resignation from a panel due to a genuine conflict of interest do not count as an abstention for these purposes.
- 8. Any dispute over a deemed resignation will be adjudicated upon by the Court in committee, with those on the panel with the abstention as non-voting members, chaired by the Council Chair or his nominee not on the Court 65, which shall then determine the issue by simple majority.

Adverse criticism of individuals

 No person or constituent part of the Union should be subjected to adverse criticism in an opinion or report unless they have had the opportunity to answer that criticism.

Staff matters

- Staff matters if mentioned in a determination or report shall be anonymised with respect to the staff members concerned.⁶⁶
- 11. No member of staff shall be adversely criticised in an opinion or report, though their actions may be mentioned in support of an adverse criticism of the President. If the actions of any staff warrant disapproval, the Court may also privately inform the President and General Manager.

Reports for inquiries or proposed rules

- 12. If the Court was requested to conduct an inquiry or review a proposed constitutional amendment, regulation, policy or act a report with its opinion upon it may be produced instead of a determination.
- 13. The report will confine itself
 - In the case of an inquiry to any matter requested in the application for the inquiry and any other matters consequent upon it.
 - In the case of a proposed constitutional amendment, regulation, policy or act to its constitutional propriety, drafting, simplicity and fairness.
- 14. The report (whether dealing with inquiries or proposed rules or acts) should reasonably reflect any points of disagreement. If this is not possible, individual members may dissent from any part of the report, and may add their comments to it.
- 15. A report shall not contain any orders under Part I of the Court regulation. If a hearing is to result in a report the Court may still make any interim determination with associated orders if necessary, in so far as it assists the making of the final report.

F. Compliance hearings

- A compliance hearing may be instigated in committee or by the original or appeals panel as appropriate, either of their own motion or upon request.
- The Court compliance panel is by default the same panel which made the original orders, or, in the case of an appealed determination, the appeals panel.

_

⁶⁵ Regulation 2.18.3; such a measure would also have to comply with Regulation 7 Part I

⁶⁶ Regulation 2.42

- It may also include additional or, if the original panellists are unable to attend, 3. replacement members appointed in same manner as a normal panel.
- 4. Additional or replacement members may only be appointed if the default panel agrees or original members cannot attend. ⁶⁸ Such new members may include those on a panel whose determination was amended on appeal.
- 5. The Court shall conduct a further hearing in the same manner as a normal
- The Court shall concern itself solely with the potential breach of the order and its 6. consequences and not revisit any decision on the facts or rules, unless new facts have come to its attention or a relevant rule or law has changed.

Appeals * G.

- 1. This Part supplements Part J of the Court Regulation.
- 2. The Court shall appoint with the approval of the Council an appellate panel of its members who are of proven and substantial ability and integrity. 65

Appeals to the Trustee Board

- In these standing orders an "appeal" is defined as an appeal from a 3. determination by the Court to another panel of its members. An appeal to the Trustee Board may be possible after this appeal process is exhausted.
- Leave to appeal internally and leave to appeal to the Trustee Board are not the 4. same, and either or both may be given or denied. If an internal appeal is heard, the Trustee Board's leave is quashed, though the appellate panel may re-grant

When appeals are possible

- 5. The appellate jurisdiction within the Court only exists if:
 - i. At least one person is a member of the appellate panel, and
 - Sufficient members of a permissible panel are available to hear an appeal.
- 6. The Court shall not hear an appeal in a matter relating to:⁷²
 - proceedings under the Disciplinary Policy (except in its role as the Union Appeals Committee itself),
 - a publication dispute in a role equivalent to the Press Complaints Commission which was itself an appeal from the Mediation Board, or

⁶⁷ Standing orders Part C

 $^{^{68}}$ Regulation 2.28 – to ensure the panel's independence this prevents it being altered through external means at any time, including when an order is being enforced, unless the two exceptions outlined here apply

Regulation 2.54

 $^{^{70}}$ Regulations 2.55 – 2.56

⁷¹ This provision is to prevent having two appeals simultaneously in different directions, with the attendant problems this could cause. An external appeal can only be made once the internal process is

exhausted.

72 The exclusions from appeal here are matters which have already been appealed, or where an appeal would be illogical, such as a report, which is normally written for the benefit of the Council or other committee which would be a better forum for grievances to be aired

- <u>17th January 2008</u>
- iii. a report produced as a result of an inquiry, or review of a proposed constitutional amendment, regulation, policy or act (but it may from an interim determination leading up to one).
- The Court shall not hear an appeal from an interim determination,⁷³ or direction⁷⁴ (including a specified compulsory direction) unless
 - i. leave is given by the panel making one,
 - ii. the final determination has also been made, or
 - iii. the Court in committee, upon appointment of the panel, provided for appeals to be permitted from interim determinations in that case. 75

Scope of appeal

- An appeal panel shall accept all the facts found by the original panel and not reopen any factual inquiry unless new and relevant evidence has emerged or an original factual decision appears unreasonable.
- An appeal panel shall confine itself to the issues which concerned the original panel, unless it determines that the interests of justice require new issues to be considered.
- 10. Subject to the above restrictions, the appeal panel may amend, rescind or add to any part of any direction, interim or final determination, or other aspect of the Court's jurisdiction in session, including any associated orders. The appeal panel may also, after making a ruling, remit any matter back to the original panel for a further determination.

Leave to make an appeal

- 11. An appeal may only be requested within two weeks of the final determination.
- 12. A person or body requesting an appeal, unless the original Court panel has given leave or it is the Council, must:
 - i. be directly affected by an order or lack thereof, and
 - justify, in the light of the restrictions on the scope of an appeal (particularly on questions of fact), upon what grounds the original determination was incorrect.
- 13. Leave may be granted, as satisfying the requirements in this Part, by
 - A majority vote of the Chair, Deputy Chair and members of the appellate panel (under standing order G2), but excluding anyone on the original panel, ⁷⁶

-

⁷³ Regulation 2.43 – these are determinations mid-way through a case to resolve preliminary matters or narrow down issues

⁷⁴ Regulations 2.30 – 2.33

⁷⁵ This is to prevent appeals from stymieing the Court mid-way through a case; however there may be larger cases when appeals may be appropriate on certain issues, so the Court can institute a main panel and appellate panel for more specialist or complex issues

⁷⁶ It follows that if an appellate panel is appointed by the Court and Council they (along with the Chair and Deputy Chair in their administrative capacity if not already members of the panel) they would need to decide whether an appeal request met the criteria as well; an independent appeal process necessarily excludes people who sat on the original panel from administering an appeal against their own decision – if all of appellate panel sat on the original panel then there cannot be an appeal in any event so it doesn't matter that they're all excluded by this provision from deciding the merits of an appeal request

- - The original panel, or
 - iii. The Council.
- If, and only if, there are insufficient available people to hear an appeal then those listed in standing order G13.i may, despite leave being granted, revoke it. In doing so they may grant or re-instate leave to appeal to the Rector.

Appointment of panel to hear appeal

- 15. The panel to hear the appeal shall be appointed in the same manner as a normal panel, except:
 - i. those listed in standing order G13.i make the appointment,
 - ii. no person upon the original panel may sit on an appeal from a direction or determination therefrom, or participate in the appointment of the appellate panel,
 - iii. only members of the appellate panel may chair it, 77
 - iv. members of the appellate panel must form a majority of members, 77
 - a member may only sit alone if approved to do so under standing order <u>C8</u>, as well as being on the appellate panel.

Deleted: by the Court and the Council

Deleted: C10

Divided panel

If the panel hearing the appeal consists of an even number of members (under standing order <u>C15.i</u>) and is evenly divided then any proposed order falls ⁷⁸, and if voting on whether to allow or dismiss an appeal, the appeal is dismissed.

Deleted: D11

H. Specified compulsory directions *

- 1. This Part supplements Part F of the Court regulation.
- 2. The three specified compulsory directions are those directions set out in regulation 2.32 to be: a requirement to attend and answer questions, production of items and search.
- 3. These provisions do not apply to the Executive Committee in exercise of its equivalent powers under regulation 5,8 (except as it or the Council may so incorporate them).

Deleted: 3

- 4. All specified compulsory directions must only be made when:
 - They are relevant to the Union administration,
 - there is no other way in which the information can be obtained, and
 - iii. their contents are likely to affect a final or interim determination.
- An application for a specified compulsory direction can be made to the Court in 5. closed session without notice to other interested parties.

⁷⁷ Regulation 2.54

 $^{^{78}}$ Orders normally need approval of the majority of the panel under standing order E4 – here the rule about the panel chair voting a second time (only for even-numbered panels) is displaced with another rule dismissing the appeal; the rationale is that for the original hearing, some kind of decision is absolutely necessary, so the chair takes it – however for appeals a split appellate panel cancels itself out and leaves the original decision to stand

⁷⁹ Regulations 2.30 (directions made administratively) – clearly a search direction (in particular) would have little use if those to be searched knew about it in advance

- 6. Any applicant for a search direction must make full disclosure of any relevant facts known to them in requesting such a direction. If such disclosure is not made the Court shall ensure that no advantage can come to any applicant as a result of such a failure, which may among other things involve revocation of the direction, exclusion from the case of anything found as a result of it or discontinuance of the case. 80
- A panel ("the SCD panel") 81 may be appointed by the Executive Committee (or in 7. an urgent situation, the President) to perform certain duties in respect of these specified compulsory directions, with the following rules:
 - Members of the Executive Committee are always members of the
 - Union members, Union or College staff or licensed members⁸² only ii. are eligible, and
 - iii. No member of the Court shall be on the panel.
- 8. One of more members of the SCD panel, excluding those who have an interest in the hearing, must be appointed by a Court panel if making a search direction or production of item direction (unless in the latter case copies can and will be made by the subjects of the direction).
- 9. SCD panel members act under the direction of the Court.
- 10. In making any order for the production of any document or item:
 - Copies of a document should be requested unless sight of the original is necessary,
 - Custody of any item (unless a copy) should be handed over to a member of the SCD panel,
 - iii. Any items should be returned as soon as is practicable.
- In executing any search direction:
 - It must be under the supervision of a member of the SCD panel,
 - ii. No search of a person or residence is permitted,
 - iii. It may only apply to the offices of a permanent member staff with the approval of the President or General Manager, 83
 - iv. Those searching must explain to any person present who asks the terms of the order and that it can be re-considered at a hearing,
 - v. Only items clearly covered by the direction may be removed or copied,
 - vi. A list must be made of any items removed or copied, and they are to be restored as soon as possible,

⁸⁰ Since the search direction is among the most Draconian of the Court's powers, anyone requesting it must be entirely fair and open

⁸¹ Since these are Draconian powers the Court delegates the task of searching and retaining items to a body outside its own membership so that members of the Court do not get too involved in the mechanics of enforcing its authority

⁸² In serious cases which necessitate independent supervision of a search, a person licensed by the Security Industry Authority or a constable could be used on the SCD panel ⁸³ Regulation 2.32.3

- vii. Documents should not be removed if satisfactory copies can be made at the time.
- viii. No electronic equipment should be removed if opportunity has been given to copy or print out the relevant material, and it is satisfied that nothing further may be found upon it,
- ix. No fragile item may be searched, used or removed unless a person accompanying the search has sufficient expertise not to damage it, and
- x. If the place of search is likely to have an unaccompanied woman, then at least one woman must accompany the search.⁸⁵

I. Disciplinary Proceedings, Appeals and Reviews

- The part supplements the Disciplinary Policy, the Disciplinary and Complaints Regulations Part H and the Clubs and Societies Policy.
- 2. Any case dealt with under this Part must follow the same procedure (namely appointment of a panel, a hearing, determination and orders) as any other case.

Disciplinary Policy

- Any rule, restriction or power in the Disciplinary Policy imposed upon or given to the Court or other person shall bind the Court in its internal administration.⁸⁶
- The selection of the chair, members and replacement Clerk (if necessary) of the Disciplinary Committee⁸⁷ shall be performed by whoever of the Chair and Deputy Chair is the Full Member of the Union, or his or her nominee within the Court.

Deleted: normally

- The removal of a chair or member of the Disciplinary Committee may be authorised by:
- Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

- i. The Chair and Deputy Chair jointly,
- ii. The Court in session, or
- iii. The Court in committee.
- 6. No member of the Court who served upon the Disciplinary Committee shall participate in the appointment of the panel to act in any appeal, or sit on it.
- Any appeal or review of proceedings under the Disciplinary Policy shall be in closed session, unless the defendant student or body wishes it to be in public.
- 8. When the Court is acting as the Union's Appeals Committee it should if possible be composed of at least five members.
- 9. A breach of a Disciplinary Policy penalty imposed or affirmed by the Court acting as the Union's Appeals Committee, or reviewing the same, shall be dealt with

⁸⁸ Disciplinary Policy paragraph 34 and regulation 2.35

⁸⁵ This reflects a rule in the (real) civil courts for search orders (CPR practice direction 25, paragraph 7.4(5) to cater for the potential vulnerability of someone in that position)

⁸⁶ Constitution 9.1.4 and regulation 2.2 prevents Union policy from binding the Court's internal administration – however the Disciplinary Policy purports to do so and has also been approved by the College Council as doing so; therefore the standing orders (which do bind the Court) 'confirm' any rule the Disciplinary Policy makes in respect of the Court's internal rules

⁸⁷ Disciplinary Policy paragraph 20

under paragraphs 46 and 47 of the Disciplinary Policy and not in a Court compliance hearing.

Disciplinary Tribunal

The Court may only act as a disciplinary tribunal under Regulation 7 Part H upon ◆ Formatted: Bullets and the request of the President, Council Chair or Trustee Board Chair.91 Numbering

- The Court shall consider whether to accept the case under Part B of the standing orders, in particular ensuring that the alleged misconduct not merely constitutes (though it may include): 91
 - a failure to maintain the confidence of the Council or other policymaking body,
 - a failure to adhere to any manifesto commitment, or
 - iii. inadequate representation on behalf of the student body.
- The Court may exercise any of its other jurisdictions at the same time as acting Formatted: Bullets and as a disciplinary tribunal. 92 Numbering
- If the President requests that the Court acts as both a disciplinary tribunal and in place of the Disciplinary Committee under paragraph 23 of the Disciplinary Policy then the panel appointed shall have both jurisdictions.
- The following procedures shall be followed in addition to others set out in the standing orders in relation to a disciplinary tribunal:
- Formatted: Bullets and Numbering
- The defendant shall have reasonable notice of the hearing and be informed of the charges against them in writing;
- ii. The defendant may bring witnesses and a representative, giving notice to the Court if so doing:
- iii. The hearing shall not be invalidated by the absence of the defendant provided reasonable notice has been given of it;
- iv. The Court shall consider firstly whether each of the charges is true, secondly whether each constitutes misconduct, and thirdly what penalty or referral may be imposed;
- The Court may amend a charge if it does not cause injustice to the defendant to do so;
- vi. The Court, if evidence of the charges taken at its highest could not either prove them or demonstrate misconduct, shall dismiss the case without hearing from the defence;93

91 Regulation 7.62

⁸⁹ When the Court sits as the Union Appeals Committee there are potentially two ways in which a breach can be dealt with - it could go (via the Court) back to a Disciplinary Committee for further sanctions to be considered, or go to the Court for a compliance hearing; since the Disciplinary Policy includes its own system for penalty breaches, breaches are dealt with under it rather than the Court's normal system
90 Regulation 7.63

⁹² Regulations 2.23 and 7.65

- vii. If the defendant does not give evidence at the hearing (and is competent to do so), or failed to mention when asked in any prior investigation something he or she later relied upon in the hearing, the Court may draw such inferences as appear proper in relation to the facts or finding of misconduct;94
- viii. Earlier misconduct shall not be presented or taken into account until a finding of misconduct has been made; and
- ix. A finding of misconduct shall only be made if no more than one member of the panel dissents.
- The Court may at any stage in the disciplinary tribunal, or in committee if considering whether to accept the matter, refer it to the Trustee Board. 96

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

Other Disciplinary Appeals

- Appeals to the Court in relation to disciplinary proceedings shall only be accepted in exceptional circumstances before an internal appeals process is exhausted.
- Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

The Court may decide to hear an appeal by way of re-hearing or review of the reasonableness of the original decision.

Mediation Board J.

- 1. This Part supplements Part K of the Court regulation.
- 2. The Court shall normally consult with the members of the Mediation Board prior to altering these parts of the standing orders relating to it.

Purpose and role

- The purpose of the Mediation Board is to mediate in a complaint about Felix or 3. any other Union publication or media outlet in order amicably to resolve any dispute about it.
- 4. The Mediation Board shall have original jurisdiction to hear any complaint to the Court in relation to the contents of a publication in a role equivalent to that of the Press Complaints Commission.

Membership

- 5. The Court shall appoint in committee one of its members (excluding the Chair, Deputy Chair and any member of the Media Group) as the Mediation Board Chair, in the same manner as appointment of Chair or Deputy Chair under standing order A7.
- 6. The Mediation Board consists of the Media Group Chair and the editors or managers of each publication governed by the Media Group. The following individuals shall also be appointed to the Mediation Board:

⁹³ Commonly known as the Galbraith test in criminal law, this means that if the evidence is particularly weak the case should be stopped as it is not the purpose of disciplinary proceedings to force a person to incriminate himself or herself in the absence of proper evidence

⁹⁴ Failure to comment or give evidence can be held against a defendant – this is of particular relevance given disciplinary tribunals are held in relation to office-holders in the Union ⁹⁵ Provision duplicated in standing order E5

⁹⁶ Regulation 7.64

- i. City and Guilds College Union Guildsheet Editor
- ii. City and Guilds College Union Live! Editor
- iii. Royal College of Science Union Broadsheet Editor
- iv. Imperial College School of Medicine Gazette Editor
- 7. The quorum is five members and proxies are not permitted.
- 8. The Mediation Board may meet separately from hearing any complaint to discuss any matter.
- When meeting to hear a publication complaint the editor or manager of the organisation subject to a complaint shall temporarily recuse themselves from membership.

Complaints

- 10. If a complaint cannot be resolved to the satisfaction of either the complainant, or the editor or manager, the matter may be referred to the Court by the Mediation Board or any party to the dispute. Once the Court is seised of the dispute, the Mediation Board relinquishes jurisdiction to hear it.
- 11. The right of a party to refer a complaint to the Court only comes into existence after the first meeting of the Mediation Board, or two weeks since the complaint was made, whichever is the earlier. ⁹⁷ * The Court may in committee or session refer such a dispute or part thereof back to the Mediation Board as an alternative to hearing the case, without prejudicing its position in the event of a further referral.
- 12. The Mediation Board shall have no role in a complaint by a member of the Court or Court as a whole when referred to the Executive Committee under regulation 2.5.
- 13. In resolving the dispute, the Mediation Board may:
 - i. Dismiss a complaint,
 - In accepting a complaint, request a publication to print or publish the result and reasoning behind it with due prominence,
 - In accepting a complaint, request a publication to correct any mistakes,
 - iv. Accept a complaint but take no action as sufficient remedial action has already been offered or undertaken, or
 - v. Make any other request which is reasonable in the circumstances.

⁹⁷ Regulations 2.22 and 2.19.4 (restrictions on summoning cases) – requires Council's approval